JOBS AND MORE JOBS
The Economic Impact of Community Organizing
CONTENTS

Foreword 3
Executive Summary 4
Introduction: Community organizing works 6
Findings 8
Conclusion 14

Appendix A: Formula Sources 16
  Funding Calculation Keys
  Sources to determine job numbers and/or non-specific funding
  GNP Calculation Keys

Appendix B: Gamaliel Affiliate Victories 18
  New Victories by Sector
  Previously Won Multi-Year Funding

On the cover: photo of Stan Musial Veterans Memorial Bridge construction. United Congregations of Metro-East helped win jobs for women and people of color on the project. (Photo via Mississippi River Bridge Project on Flickr).
FOREWORD

Gamaliel is pleased to present this update on our community organizing as jobs creator report. As described here our impact is significant, but there’s more to do. Too many Americans are suffering from a winner-take-all economy with huge income inequality. We must spread the wealth wider. Many of the jobs our advocacy won in recent years, as described in this study, connect to infrastructure construction or redevelopment. Our country badly needs more infrastructure investment, as news reports document every day – and building the country, builds jobs.

We surprised ourselves with the impact of the work documented here—the numbers really add up, when you stop to count. We recognize how much further we have to go. In particular, at Gamaliel we believe that with all of our country’s needs in this area it’s only fair that women and people of color should have the same shot at this work as others. Yet they lag far behind others in their participation in this work. That’s why Gamaliel is advocating updated standards ensuring more women and people of color have a chance to win positions with federal construction contractors on infrastructure projects, as we highlight in the conclusion and recommendations section of this report.

What this work has reinforced for us is to bring home the value of our advocacy – in jobs and dollars and cents. It has another dimension, too: the creation of dignity and pride for those who work the jobs our advocacy helped to create. We believe that at the heart of our work is economic prosperity and working to ensure jobs for all. As organizers and advocates, we can’t directly create those jobs. We can create and join in conversations that lead to tough decisions by elected officials, industry leaders and others to craft sound economic policies that favor employment for all our families. We hope this report helps validate such decisions.
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Community organizing brings victories to working people who provide for their families and builds movements that unite people around a shared vision of social justice. To these achievements this report adds a third contribution: adding up the advocacy victories of organized people highlights that community organizers are, in an important sense, creators of jobs that move hundreds of thousands to employment and create opportunities for many more.

We realized several years ago that affiliates’ advocacy victories were also creating or saving jobs. When Gamaliel of the Heartland – the Missouri-based groups of Metropolitan Organization for Racial and Economic Equity (MORE2) and Metropolitan Congregations United (MCU) came together to stop a plan that could have replaced school district offices with an un-tested new structure, they preserved a stable education system for thousands of mostly African-American and Latino families – and they also saved hundreds of jobs in the community for teachers, support staff and administrators. Likewise when Pennsylvania Interfaith Impact Network (PIIN) advocated for a significant legislative investment in public transportation in the state’s 2014 budget, transit riders won – but so did job seekers. These and several other stories are highlighted in this report, along with the data that show this method of counting the jobs generated by these advocacy victories provides another angle on the role of advocacy in our communities and regions.

In addition to highlighting the job creation aspect of these victories, this method of tracking our work also quantifies and aggregates Gamaliel affiliates’ impact, providing
a useful yardstick to measure one aspect of our efforts year in and year out. Finally, using generally accepted formulas that track economic impact, looking at community organizing as a job creator provides a sense of the value of these community-organizing efforts as a share of the nation’s Gross Domestic Product, or economic output for the year.

Looking at the achievements of the Gamaliel network among its 43 affiliates across 16 states, in 2012 and 2013, Gamaliel and its affiliates won victories worth more than $13 billion, creating more than 450,000 jobs and generating more than a $17 billion increase in the GDP. As this report suggests, the lesson learned is a powerful one: by working together for the common good we can create jobs and prosperity for our communities—a powerful argument in support of community organizing, particularly faith-based community organizing.

After decades of campaign setbacks, MOSES and Gamaliel of Michigan won a Regional Transit Authority (RTA) in the fall of 2012. Effective organizing and persistence paid off. Their success began in the summer of 2010, when Deacon Cindy Reese, a longtime MOSES transit leader, built her team through a millage (transit tax) campaign in Oakland County. After some hard work and outreach to transit riders, the millage passed, firing up the team for the next fight.

The MOSES Transportation Task Force was forged in the powerful way that MOSES effectively operates: regionally, cooperatively and strategically. While Reese was getting the rest of MOSES involved in the city of Detroit, kicking off the RTA campaign at a 500-person public meeting, suburban MOSES leaders Pat Hammer (of Birmingham Unitarian Church) and Rev. John Hice (pastor of Royal Oak First United Methodist) engaged a rallying team of supporters from the crucial suburban counties of the Motor City. It was through their bi-partisan, multi-county strategic framework that MOSES leadership was able to effectively educate legislators to make this reality for Metro Detroit.

While the city of Detroit ultimately became an ally, MOSES had to get its officials’ attention first. After getting no response to repeated requests for meetings, MOSES held a “Prayer Action” at City Hall, where the chants and songs ignited the crowd. Their message was received and monthly meetings with the city commenced. MOSES also continued to build their relationship with the Amalgamated Transit Union and other allies through the winter, and connected with federal legislators to get their support for an RTA. The team continued to host public actions to attract media attention at bus stops throughout the winter and spring. 

(continued next page)
INTRODUCTION

Community Organizing Works

The key takeaway of Jobs and More Jobs is this: organizing creates jobs. Some definitions and a short history are in order. In Community Organizing as Job Creator (2011) the first edition of this report, Gamaliel noted that community organizers:

1) **create the public space** in which real people come together around a shared set of values to build powerful coalitions that improve the civil, social, and economic conditions of their communities.

2) **develop leaders** who effectively wage and sustain long-term campaigns around the issues they face.¹

Much has happened since then: the Occupy movement, a jobless recovery, the (arguably) peaking of the Tea Party, and President Obama’s re-election. The practice of organizing has received more attention. Philanthropists and other decision-makers, in particular, have done their homework on organizing. What attracted their attention is a growing interest in advocacy strategies on one hand and the capacity of organizing to build and strengthen movements for social justice. For example, in 2012 the Interfaith Funders released an authoritative study that showed how institutionally-based community organizing, based primarily in congregations, has reached a critical mass of Americans.²

However, with increased attention has come greater scrutiny. Evaluation of advocacy and organizing — whether local campaigns or for national movement-building purposes — has always been challenging.³ What this report does that is unusual in community organizing is quantify the impact of organizing campaigns on the national economy. The findings detailed here are a testament to the fact that even as many Americans continue to struggle to make ends meet, the impact has been significant.

The network’s three-year Fire of Faith campaign seeks to move 1 million people nationwide into living-wage jobs by 2015. Gamaliel leaders and organizers believe that other organizing networks and multi-issue community organizing centers, such as the Center for Popular Democracy, Center for Community Change, DART, Industrial Areas Foundation, National People’s Action, and PICO National Network, would find similar results through program evaluation of their victories. Gamaliel offers this analysis as a case study for other organizers, leaders, funders and public officials.

---


MOSES's focus on relationship building paid off: in front of key legislators, county executives, activist organizations, and more than a hundred activists and students at a University of Michigan Ford School of Public Policy, Dennis Schornack, Governor Snyder's transportation point person, told audience members that it was MOSES who actively engaged him with the state transit coalition and showed him the power of relationship building.

In the long run, it took two legislative sessions, countless meetings, thousands of phone calls, and dozens of public demonstrations before MOSES and Gamaliel of Michigan won the RTA. Winning something as significant as a Regional Transit Authority that will finally bring an integrated transit system to the “Motor City,” as well as a significant increase in transit dollars from the federal government is a special feather in the cap of a great grassroots leader like Cindy Reese. “If I had it all to do over again, knowing how much work it would be, how hard it would be to compromise and how many volunteer hours I would have to put in, would I do it? In a ‘Detroit minute.’ I’m waiting for God to send me the next winning campaign. We feel ready to take on the world,” says Cindy, with a smile.

MOSES Media Links:
In Detroit, a Long-Overdue Push to Create a Cohesive Transit System, bit.ly/1nCD0VC
Reclaim democracy, protect the vulnerable says faith community, bit.ly/1pc3Dwm
Legislating Like It’s 1979: Lansing Ponders Metro Detroit Regional Transit Authority, bit.ly/1A7mM1c
Southeast Michigan’s Regional Transit Authority holds first meeting, bit.ly/1sTc8mr
For nearly 10 years, Gamaliel has used job creation and access to jobs for our leaders and other constituents as a yardstick of our advocacy success. Transportation Equity Network (TEN), Gamaliel’s campaign arm, pushed for a more sophisticated measure of community-organizing effectiveness that came to be known as Community Organizing as Job Creator. TEN, through its alliances with pre-apprentice training programs, bus-riders unions, union locals and training programs, and transit agencies, began to understand that it not only matters that transit service and other transportation programs allow low income people to access opportunities, their impact on the local and state economy is an essential building block in creating vital communities.

Through the years, officials in government, nonprofits and business have developed and refined economic formulas to estimate the jobs impact of every federal transit and infrastructure dollar. Gamaliel and TEN leaders realized their victories, whether transit-oriented or not, could be quantified using similar methods and that using these methods to talk about the work puts it in a different light – advocacy victories are building state and local economies. Figure 1 illustrates this process.

Figure 1: Organizing Wins Create Jobs Create Value

This report’s methodology starts with researching the dollar value of a given project to which a partner has committed. While not every victory can be quantified in dollar terms, many can. This information was used in combination with generally accepted formulas for calculating conservative estimates of the number of jobs each investment creates, and its subsequent economic payoff in terms of Gross Domestic Product (GDP). The value of this approach is in its ability to compare and aggregate organizing victories to achieve a yardstick of productivity for organizing.
These methods were originally outlined in Community Organizing as Job Creator. That report, produced by Gamaliel in 2011, found that:

- From 2006 through 2011, the group's organizing work directed more than $16.6 billion into infrastructure, education and transit.
- This created and saved approximately 639,000 jobs, generating nearly $22 billion Gross Domestic Product (GDP).

This report uses the same methods to bring those findings up to date. Using this method, in 2012 and 2013, Gamaliel and its affiliates won victories worth nearly $13 billion, creating more than 450,000 jobs and generating more than a $17 billion increase in the GDP. Table 1 summarizes the totals.

Victories ranged from $33,000 for a single saved or additional bus route to $5.5 billion in transit funding that was saved or retained in the face of political opposition or concerted attempts to cut these funds. Here are some additional examples of how victories are calculated:

Education: in 2013, NOAH and VOICE in Western New York prevented 2 schools, Lafayette High and East High Schools, from closing, saving a combined total of 145 teacher jobs. Using Indeed.com as a source for median annual salaries for public school teachers in Buffalo at $41,000, this amounts to funds of $5,945,000. Using Moody’s Analytics as the source for determining the increase to the GDP - every dollar of increased funding (other than transit funding) increases GDP by $1.31 in the next year - this translates to a $7,787,950 bump in the GDP. These calculations do not take into account the additional related jobs saved that are involved in running public schools, such as school nurses and custodial/maintenance workers.

Following four years of fighting for emergency funding to avoid major mass transit cuts, the Pennsylvania Interfaith Impact Network (PIIN) and its partners won a comprehensive transportation bill that sets up sustained mass transit funding of at least $485 million per year in the state and region. Such a long-term campaign with significant results required PIIN to tailor their organizing and tactics to two different government administrations.

Organizing for mass transit funding under former Governor Ed Rendell’s Democratic administration focused on building a relationship with the governor, while alerting him and his constituents to the danger of transportation cuts. PIIN held a “rolling rally:” 50 cars decorated with signs showing threatened transit routes followed a mass transit bus downtown. The action culminated in a 150-person rally. PIIN’s combination of visible tactics and the support of local governments, transit unions, and businesses ultimately led to the governor’s signature on a comprehensive mass transit bill. Unfortunately, Pennsylvania’s plan to fund this bill through tolling met federal opposition and the legislation was scrapped.

Not one to give up, PIIN galvanized itself and its partners for a fight that would ensure permanent mass transit funding through the state budget. PIIN knew that new Republican Governor Tom Corbett was already concerned about transportation; his administration funded a self-study on how to effectively fund and stabilize mass transit. PIIN’s job was to make sure the governor listened to his own study commission. They went back to their grassroots supporters and did additional outreach to congregations across the state. Two thousand concerned citizens wrote postcard messages to the Governor, imploring him (continued next page)
FINDINGS (cont.)

Food Justice: In 2012, MOSES received a $2 million grant commitment from the Secretary of Agriculture to advance their “Soil to Shelf” campaign and develop a Co-op Store. Government websites indicate that co-op expansion at this level supports more than 100 high-quality local jobs. For this example, the GDP increase translates to $2,620,000.

Infrastructure: As a result of United Congregations of Metro-East’s statewide Project Labor Agreement (discussed in detail in UCM case study), 138 minority and women construction workers were employed to build the recently-opened Stan Musial Veterans Memorial bridge over the Mississippi. Because these jobs went to women and people of color we counted them as new, benefiting historically underemployed populations. Using the highway construction funding ratio documented in Appendix A, of 27,800 jobs per billion dollars, these 138 new workers translate to $4,964,029 in funds, raising the GDP by $6,502,878, using Moody’s 1.31 multiplier.

Job Training: Another example from UCM is a special provision from Illinois Department of Transportation (IDOT), allowing a $10 per hour training incentive to prime contractors who hire graduates of IDOT’s Highway Construction Careers Training Program to work on federally and state funded projects. We were able to obtain a chart from IDOT documenting placement of 478 trainees from this program. Funding incentive reimbursed to them as a result of this provision was $66,000. Using Moody’s multiplier of 1.31, this extra funding was used to determine the bump in GDP to be $86,460.

Transit: In 2013 NAOMI won an extra $50,000 per year, effective for 2013 and 2014, for bus service in Weston, WI. According to Amalgamated Transit Union, the jobs to funding ratio for transit operations is 60,000 jobs per billion dollars or 60 jobs per million dollars. (see Appendix A) The NAOMI victory represents 3 jobs and using Moody’s Analytics multiplier that shows transit funding increases GDP by $1.44 for every transit dollar spent, represents a $72,000 increase in GDP.
Food Justice and Infrastructure: In 2012, the Syracuse ACTS Food Task Force won the opening of a full-service grocery store on the south side of Syracuse, a neighborhood that had no easy access to groceries for three years. In addition to boosting the Food Justice sector and increasing the number of jobs for grocery store workers, the store first had to be built, providing construction jobs for which infrastructure formulas were used. Online research (fmi.org) showed 46,000 square feet was the average size of grocery stores in 2010, and $80 to $110 per square foot is the average construction cost, covering labor and materials. Using $100/sq. ft. for ease in calculations, this victory translates to funding of $4,600,000. Using the Alliance for American Manufacturing formula of 18 jobs per $1 million in infrastructure construction, funds to build the grocery store translates to 83 jobs (18 x 4.6). The increased GDP calculates to $6,526,000 (per the 1.31 factor from Moody’s Analytics, see above). In addition to these calculations, we determined from the same website source that an average grocery store employs about 90 people (3.4 million stores/37,459 employees) and from another source that an average salary for grocery store workers is $25,000, amounting to additional funds of $2,250,000 from this same victory. This translates to a GDP increase of nearly $3 million. Adding the figures for both the Food Justice and Infrastructure sectors comes to $6.85 million in funding, creating 173 jobs, and increasing the GDP to about $9 million, as a result of this one victory.

Connecting mass transit and highway funding in a single bill was a key maneuver which guaranteed the sustainability of this victory. Not only does the new funding stabilize the transit system, but it also sets the stage for the restoration of past cuts and provides a base for building a stronger regional transit system in the future.

PIIN Media Links:
Riders, advocates push back against proposed transit cuts, bit.ly/IrBTD5D
Community organizations protest Corbett’s spending cuts, bit.ly/IoddG7T
Transit backers rally in Downtown Pittsburgh, bit.ly/IrLR3HG
Interfaith group holds vigil for public transit, bit.ly/Ipc0uwp
Table 1: Summary of Gamaliel 2012/2013 Victories by Sector

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sector</th>
<th>Funds (millions)</th>
<th>Jobs Created/Saved</th>
<th>Increased GDP (millions)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>$6,486</td>
<td>97,882</td>
<td>$8,497</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food Justice</td>
<td>$4</td>
<td>192</td>
<td>$6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Infrastructure</td>
<td>$228</td>
<td>3,088</td>
<td>$299</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job Training</td>
<td>$51</td>
<td>1,985</td>
<td>$66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transit</td>
<td>$6,315</td>
<td>354,569</td>
<td>$8,379</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Totals</strong></td>
<td><strong>$13,084</strong></td>
<td><strong>457,715</strong></td>
<td><strong>$17,247</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

While we recognize that using economic impact formulas is not an exact science, in compiling the figures staff have sought to err on the conservative side in counting results from all victories. The clear message of these results is that the organization has had significant impact in the past two years.4

It should be noted that the figures in Table 1 reflect reports from affiliates of victories and how much money was pledged or reported (typically, in news media reports or directly by governmental bodies). In some cases, victories include a commitment to create or preserve a specific number of jobs. For example, in New Hampshire in 2012, ABLE won a commitment to fund adult services jobs for 55 families, with two workers for each family, or 110 jobs. The numbers of jobs reported in the “Education” and “Job Training” lines have been adjusted to reflect an average of those calculated using median annual salaries from sources listed in Appendix A or based on the standard economic assumption that $125,000 in GDP creates a job.

The vast majority of Gamaliel and TEN’s victories result in the creation of public jobs (government positions), jobs that are paid for with federal or local tax revenue (transit construction and operation, infrastructure construction, unionized teacher positions) or good paying jobs that are unionized (union grocery store employees, police). However, some of our campaigns have resulted in jobs that may not be union positions (home health care workers, pre-school teachers, librarians, taxi drivers, nurses, social workers, trainers in pre-apprentice training facilities).

4 See for example EPI’s discussion of this when the first report came out.
Gamaliel’s theological framework for its jobs organizing includes living wages, collective bargaining, and benefits that assist working parents such as paid sick days. We believe that as a faith-based organization it is essential to work toward labor practices that allow all families to thrive and that build the middle class.

However, a significant ethical problem sometimes invades our work when our leaders are forced to choose between the lesser of two evils such as infrastructure development provided by public-private partnerships. Infrastructure development is essential, it provides jobs and builds local economies, but public-private partnerships have proven to be less than ideal in preserving accountability as well as transparency to the public about the use of tax dollars. In worst-case scenarios, such as the infamous Chicago parking meters agreement, the public sector is required to reimburse the private entity if a street is closed or if a natural disaster occurs.

Gamaliel’s leaders also face difficult choices when regressive taxes are proposed as a method of paying for services that low income people need, such as sales taxes that support housing trust funds. Gamaliel and TEN haven’t taken a stand on a current federal debate, increasing the gas tax, partly because Gamaliel’s leadership thinks that property taxes or general revenue would be a fairer, less impactful way to fund federal transportation, even though the Highway Trust Fund funds para-transit and mass transit that benefit people with disabilities and low income people.

Ultimately, Gamaliel and TEN affiliates make these tough, final calls – they may decide to sit out a revenue fight which they see as regressive, as Metropolitan Congregations United is doing on the current Missouri transportation tax, or they may decide to wade in, regardless of their reservations.

United Congregations of Metro East’s (UCM) work on getting a statewide Project Labor Agreement (PLA) signed, which included minority hiring requirements, has led to increased employment in communities that need it most. Through their work in getting one of the most progressive state PLAs to include low-income people, the southeastern Illinois Gamaliel affiliate has proven that creative organizing can lead to equitable employment. Case in point: the recently completed Mississippi River Bridge project in St. Louis. By the end of September 2012 minority construction workers performed over 23 percent of the labor on the project, and just over 5 percent of the work was performed by women construction workers. Through spearheading this victory, UCM showed Illinois that they were serious about putting people to work.

Meetings with Illinois Department of Transportation (IDOT) Secretary Ann Schneider were moving slowly, and it was clear to UCM that to be taken seriously, a serious display of people power was necessary. The result was a twofold statewide effort. First, UCM, with Gamaliel of Illinois, organized a demonstration at IDOT where, through sheer numbers and noise, they demanded and achieved serious talks for a fair PLA. Second, UCM and Gamaliel of Illinois organized a demonstration at IDOT where, through sheer numbers and noise, they demanded and achieved serious talks for a fair PLA. Second, UCM and Gamaliel of Illinois organized a demonstration at IDOT where, through sheer numbers and noise, they demanded and achieved serious talks for a fair PLA. Second, UCM and Gamaliel of Illinois organized a demonstration at IDOT where, through sheer numbers and noise, they demanded and achieved serious talks for a fair PLA.
This report begs the question, if organizing is so great, why are so many still struggling?

That’s a major reason why infrastructure creation and the potential for increasing access to jobs is a major thrust of our campaign work. One of our leading campaigns is our work to get the Obama administration to issue new administrative rules to update, for the first time since 1980, federal contractors’ hiring goals for women and people of color on construction sites. Changing these regulations will spur municipalities and regions to update their own regulations to match federal changes. The administration has made significant moves in this direction, for example, by signing the Fair Pay and Safe Workplaces executive order in the last week of July.

We believe that community organizing can serve as an antidote for apathy and lack of accountability. When the community is involved in solving public problems -- as in the creation, implementation and monitoring of the Missouri model that built a strong, well-trained and diverse construction workforce -- then ground-breaking solutions can not only be envisioned, they can be implemented. The below recommendations reflect this belief in the need for greater community involvement in public decision-making.

1 Representative decision-making bodies at all levels of government must engage community organizing groups to ensure that new policies and legislation are equitably and consistently implemented and that stakeholders have a clear understanding of their scope, purpose, and application.

2 Local government, representative decision-making bodies, and regional planning organizations must provide full transparency, accountability, and meaningful community engagement in decisions that impact their communities—especially on issues that impact the creation and retention of jobs.

3 To continue to promote access to jobs, local, state and federal government agencies must reallocate budget resources spent on incarceration and move them to treatment alternatives and diversions, job re-entry programs, universal pre-K, and low-performing high schools.

4 The federal government must increase investment in infrastructure job training for low-income people, people of color, and women. Congress and relevant federal agencies (e.g., U.S. departments of Labor and Transportation) must act swiftly and decisively to implement the President’s FY 2015 budget proposal which calls for tripling the number of job training centers in this country; and investing in community colleges that support job-driven training and engage in partnership with business, industry, and labor.

5 The federal government must update U.S. Department of Labor affirmative action and apprenticeship regulations immediately. People of color and women are excluded from equitable access to career-path opportunities on federally-funded construction projects because these regulations: 1) reflect significantly outdated demographic data; 2) ignore the real-world practices of the construction industry and the use of Project Labor Agreements (PLAs); and 3) contain weak enforcement provisions.
The last policy recommendation, number 5, comes directly out of our current jobs campaign. Gamaliel has been stymied in its jobs work by three out of date recommendations from the US departments of Labor and Housing and Urban Development (last updated in 1980). We have run into these superannuated federal affirmative action regulations whenever Gamaliel works to increase diversity.

Examples include something as limited as an Amtrak station remodel in Niagara, NY to a state Project Labor Agreement for Illinois that affects the capitol budget of the state (a budget the size of some small countries). We heartily recommend that President Barack Obama take action as soon as possible on these outdated regulations so that women, people with disabilities and people of color are employed in the construction trades in the numbers that reflect their percentage in our society.

UCM Wins Statewide PLA for Illinois (cont.)

While the significant passing of the statewide PLA led to tangible results, such as the Mississippi River Bridge project, statewide victories are only as good as federal regulations allow. Even though IDOT is willing to increase their minority hiring requirements, outdated federal regulations place caps on IDOT’s official workforce goals. UCM and the Gamaliel Network are moving forward with a federal strategy to update federal workforce regulations so that federal law encourages states to employ their ready workers.

UCM Media Links:
IDOT Sec. Ann Schneider to Tout Minority Workforce Agreement, Affects Mississippi River Bridge, bit.ly/1mFweIK
Funding Calculation Keys

Transit operations – 60,000 jobs per billion dollars, 60 per million (source: Amalgamated Transit Union)
Transit capital – 24,000 jobs per billion dollars, 24 per million (source: American Public Transportation Association)
Transit combined – 36,000 jobs per billion dollars (assumes a mix of 29% capital and 71% operations spending) (source: American Public Transportation Association)
Transit construction – 55,600 jobs per billion dollars
Training - $7,000 per student (source: Dept. of Labor)
Highway construction – 13,000 jobs per billion dollars (source: http://www.fhwa.dot.gov/policy/otps/pubs/impacts/index.htm)
Infrastructure construction - 18,000 jobs per billion dollars, 18 per million (source: Alliance for American Manufacturing www.americanmanuf acturing.net/files/peri_aam_finaljan16_new.pdf)

Note: Although we are aware of other standard economic formulas by which to calculate the number of jobs correlating to the GDP which result in lower job numbers, we feel confident that the ATU and governmental sources used are reliable given their specificity to the transportation sector.

Sources to Determine Job Numbers and/or Non-Specified Funding

All salaries for Education and Job Training Category jobs, and Baltimore, MD taxi driver salaries - www.indeed.com/salary
CA Statewide Education Funding - Teachers @ 38% & Administrators @ 6% of total costs (Medium column of charts, averaged percentages of Elementary Level and High School Districts Statewide) - www.cde.ca.gov/fg/fr/sa/cefavgsalaries.asp
Detroit, MI Co-op store funding from Secretary of Agriculture - co-op expansion supports more than 100 high-quality local jobs - www.rurdev.usda.gov/STELPRD4019237_print.html
Buffalo Day care funding 2010 victory – $1.7 million benefiting 1,600 children = $1,063 per child per year

GNP Multipliers

Transit Funding – every dollar increases GNP by $1.44 in the next year
Other aid to states (infrastructure, etc.) – every dollar increases GNP by $1.31 in the next year
WISDOM, the statewide Gamaliel network in Wisconsin, successfully executed a two-year campaign that quadrupled the funding for an important anti-crime program, Treatment Alternatives and Diversions (TAD). By steering people towards possible employment rather than incarceration, this increase in funding will result in at least 1,000 fewer jail and/or prison admissions per year saving Wisconsin taxpayers $3 million. WISDOM leaders knew from the outset that a long-term TAD campaign was a good investment for Wisconsin.

The campaign began at the grassroots level. Two hundred people throughout Wisconsin were trained to advocate for criminal justice reform by WISDOM leaders and organizers. Once trained, these advocates reached out to local universities, clubs, legislators, and county officials to rally support for TAD. This cross-state effort culminated in a 1,000-person rally in Madison that two-thirds of the constituents of the legislature attended.

WISDOM’s broad-based organizing paid off. Dozens of supporters expressed support for increases to TAD in the state budget at local legislative hearings. Religious and business leaders, as well as TAD graduates, provided clear testimony on the importance and effectiveness of TAD. The clear calls from these constituents led to Republican sponsorship and bi-partisan support, and an initial $1.5 million increase to TAD.

However, this money could only go so far in realizing TAD’s potential, supplying funding for just one-third of the counties who applied. WISDOM went back to strategizing at the local level, encouraging as many counties as possible to apply for TAD funding to demonstrate the demand for the program. The legislature rose to the challenge and awarded TAD a further $1.5 million increase from the state budget surplus.

Increasing TAD’s funding has resulted in greater employment and decreased recidivism. WISDOM continues to work for more funding, specifically targeting communities that have higher incarceration rates. Through advocating bi-partisan cooperation in the legislature, combined with local, county, and statewide organizing, WISDOM is proving that being “smart on crime” is the same thing as being “smart on employment.”

WISDOM Media Links
Wisconsin faith-based groups seek meeting on parole rules, bit.ly/IA6zB0K
Healthier Lives, Stronger Families, Safer Communities: How Increasing Funding For Alternatives To Prison Will Save Lives And Money In Wisconsin, bit.ly/Ir8EpaU
Groups say state should fund treatment over incarceration, Wisc. State Journal, bit.ly/Ir8Ejtr
Group says prison alternatives would save millions, Watchdog.org, bit.ly/IpGU6yC
Activists push for fewer prisoners, bit.ly/ImFe7Te

WISDOM Wins TAD Funding for Wisconsin

WISDOM’s statewide grassroots organizing paid off. Organizers initially “…created the supply for TAD, so we could turn around and create the demand for it too,” explained David Liners, state director of WISDOM. This comprehensive approach culminated in an annual appropriation of $4 million of TAD funding from Wisconsin’s state budget, creating a sustainable funding stream likely to continue into the future.
## New Victories by Sector

### Education

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Location 1</th>
<th>Location 2</th>
<th>Action</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td>Santa Rosa, CA</td>
<td></td>
<td>Supported the passing of statewide Proposition 30, a temporary tax to fund education that would tax high-income earners and stop $6 billion in cuts to public schools.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Peterborough, NH</td>
<td></td>
<td>Won a $3 million addition to the budget to provide funding for Adult Services to 55 families who have been on wait lists. ($1.5 million state funds with $1.5 million federal matching funds.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Kalamazoo, M</td>
<td></td>
<td>Collaborated to secure $1.5 million funding for a Nurse- Family Partnership program to provide trained nurses, benefiting 100 infants of at-risk mothers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Niagara Falls and Buffalo, NY</td>
<td></td>
<td>Kept Lafayette High School from closing. (90 teachers)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Niagara Falls and Buffalo, NY</td>
<td></td>
<td>Secured $90,000 start-up funding from the City of Buffalo to establish the Peacekeepers Program for gang prevention.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Eau Claire, WI</td>
<td></td>
<td>Won an increase of $1.5 million funding for Treatment Instead of Prison program.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013</td>
<td>Kalamazoo, MI</td>
<td></td>
<td>Won an additional $1.5 million funding for the Nurse-Family Partnership program.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Kalamazoo, MI</td>
<td></td>
<td>Won $3,125,500 to fund a Pre-K Ready Fours Program.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Niagara Falls and Buffalo, NY</td>
<td></td>
<td>Secured $300,000 annual funding for the Peacekeepers Program.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Niagara Falls and Buffalo, NY</td>
<td></td>
<td>Prevented 2 schools, Lafayette High and East High Schools, from closing, saving 145 teacher jobs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Syracuse, NY</td>
<td></td>
<td>Won funding from the Syracuse City School District to add four full-day Pre-K classrooms for the 2013-14 school year ($275,000, benefiting approximately 75 four-year-olds, to increase to 800 by 2016)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Akron, OH</td>
<td></td>
<td>Established a Resource Center for Ex-offenders</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pittsburgh, PA</td>
<td></td>
<td>Won a School Board vote to recall 30 laid off teachers in lieu of hiring Teach for America teachers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pittsburgh, PA</td>
<td></td>
<td>Won a School Board vote to prevent a school closure in the Greater Pittsburgh Schools.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Wisconsin Statewide</td>
<td></td>
<td>Won a 150% increase in state funding for alternatives to incarceration.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Wisconsin Statewide</td>
<td></td>
<td>Won several local victories to expand alternatives to incarceration.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Metro Organization for Racial and Economic Equity (MORE2) has led the charge in stopping a private takeover of the Kansas City public school district. By highlighting a lack of integrity and transparency from the state board of education over a potential plan to disband struggling, unaccredited school districts and give their operating control over to contracted agencies in a similar fashion to charter schools, the Kansas City Gamaliel affiliate redirected the conversation towards addressing school control and student outcomes.

By utilizing a Freedom of Information request to expose state records, MORE2 uncovered a series of emails that showed the Missouri Department of Elementary and Secondary Education (DESE) commenced a contracted study that resulted in a series of recommendations to eliminate troubled school districts by turning them over to private interest groups, while ignoring statewide budgeting issues around education. Suspiciously, this contract was awarded to a consultancy group with less experience and a lower bid than other organizations.

Taking on the role of watchdog, MORE2 leaders publicly called out DESE and other local groups that would use these recommendations to dismantle the Kansas City school district and deny it the provisional accreditation it deserved. “The part of the process of fairness that we’re seeking would include an open, objective look at the progress that has been made in the last couple of years,” MORE2’s Rabbi Douglas Alpert said. In light of MORE2’s work, the state board had no choice but to delay the plans and hold a series of public forums on the issue.

To make their point clear, MORE2, in partnership with the St. Louis Gamaliel affiliate Metropolitan Congregations United (MCU), released a report that discussed their opposition to school privatization efforts. They illustrated the disadvantages of pursuing decentralized budgeting, utilizing cheaper and inexperienced teachers such as those provided by Teach For America, and relying upon the loose regulations of charter school models. The organizations emphasized the need for DESE to provide not only more time for troubled districts to demonstrate improvements, but to eliminate privatization as a recourse altogether.

Due in part to the call for more local control, transparency, and integrity, MORE2 was able to get a local Kansas City representative appointed to the state school board, and have Missouri Governor Nixon and state legislators demand an audit of DESE’s study. Fighting this privatization plan has saved hundreds of jobs in the school district while keeping educational options open for students.

MORE2 has put their finger on a hot button issue that beats across this country and is leading the way in making sure community impact has first received community input, with the ultimate aim of local community control.

MORE2 Media Links:
Missouri’s chief educator is a lightning rod in reform efforts, St. Louis Today, bit.ly/1x26Gvh
Emails detail a hidden plan for Kansas City Public Schools - KansasCity.com, bit.ly/1ksmst2
Kansas City teachers rally in support of public education, KSHB, bit.ly/1x27pMR
Calls mount for Nicastro resignation after e-mails released, KSHB, bit.ly/1nqTJtz
## Food Justice

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Victory Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td>Syracuse, NY</td>
<td>Won the opening of a full-service grocery store on the south side of Syracuse, a neighborhood that had no easy access to groceries for three years.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Detroit, MI</td>
<td>Received a $2 million grant commitment from the Sec. of Agriculture to advance the “Soil to Shelf” campaign and develop a Co-op Store.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Infrastructure

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Victory Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td>Kansas City</td>
<td>Celebrated renewal and strengthening of 2007 Construction Workforce Ordinance.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Metro East, IL</td>
<td>Increased number of minority and female construction workers on the Mississippi River Bridge Project.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Peterborough, NH</td>
<td>Won a $4 million bond issue to renovate Convale High School to make it ADA compliant.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Syracuse, NY</td>
<td>The full-service grocery store won for the south side of Syracuse was built.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013</td>
<td>Milwaukee, WI</td>
<td>Secured $2,000,000 for new affordable home construction (17 homes).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Job Training

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Victory Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td>Metro East, IL</td>
<td>Secured a special provision from IDOT, allowing a $10 per hour training incentive to prime contractors who hire graduates of IDOT’s Highway Construction Careers Training Program to work on federally funded projects.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Milwaukee, WI</td>
<td>Established a Transitional Jobs Coalition which secured TANF dollars in 2011 for a demonstration project. More than 1,780 of the 3,000 participants in the program have gone on to permanent, unsubsidized jobs (890 employees or half estimated for 2012).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013</td>
<td>Wisconsin Statewide</td>
<td>Won an increase in the size of the Transitional Jobs program, which now gives employers incentives to hire more than 3,000 long-term unemployed people to temporary jobs. Of these, more than half are retained for full-time unsubsidized employment.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Appendix B | Gamaliel Affiliate Victories

### Transit

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td>Honolulu, HI</td>
<td>Saved $5.5 billion in funding that was threatened by a “tea-party” Mayoral candidate.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Greater Lansing, MI</td>
<td>Won passage of an Ingham County Property Tax - A four-year, 0.12 mill levy increase to supplement funding for the Capital Area Transportation Authority, expected to generate approximately $784,000 annually.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Detroit, MI</td>
<td>Won passage of an Oakland County Property Tax - A two-year renewal of a 0.59 mill levy to support service by the Suburban Mobility Authority for Regional Transportation (SMART).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Detroit, MI</td>
<td>Won passage of legislation to establish a Regional Transit Authority and provide over $20 million in federal funding to develop regional bus coordination throughout southeastern Michigan.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Kansas City</td>
<td>Won establishment of Sunday bus service in Wyandotte County and “one seat” service between downtown KC, MO and Village West in Wyandotte County.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Kansas City</td>
<td>Gained an added bus route through Marlborough, increasing access to healthy foods.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Niagara Falls and Buffalo, NY</td>
<td>Saved a vital bus route that connects an economically challenged city (Lockport) with a surrounding area where most of the employment opportunities exist.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Akron, OH</td>
<td>Won passage of a five-year Mahoning County Sales Tax renewal of 0.25% for the Western Reserve Transit Authority. $7.5 million was raised in 2011.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pittsburgh, PA</td>
<td>Prevented 35% cut in transit routes - saved elimination of 40 routes along with most suburban service.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Kenosha, WI</td>
<td>Convinced the Council to restore hourly service on Saturday by adding three buses, adding about $60,000 annually to transit operation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Neenah, WI</td>
<td>Stopped bus service cut, $160,000 funding.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013</td>
<td>Kalamazoo, MI</td>
<td>Won passage of a three-year millage renewal for Kalamazoo City, expected to generate about $1,024,425 annually.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Detroit, MI</td>
<td>Won passage of a two-year renewal for Oakland County Property Tax to support services by the Suburban Mobility Authority for Regional Transportation (SMART).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Kansas City</td>
<td>Strengthened and renewed previously won Workforce Ordinance.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Transit (cont.)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>City</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2013</td>
<td>Kansas City</td>
<td>Workforce Ordinance Strengthened &amp; Renewed in April 2013.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Niagara Falls and Buffalo, NY</td>
<td>Won a 150% increase in state funding for alternatives to incarceration.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Akron, OH</td>
<td>Won several local victories to expand alternatives to incarceration.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pittsburgh, PA</td>
<td>Instrumental in passage of a comprehensive transportation bill that sets up sustained funding of at least $485 million/year for mass transit in the state and region.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Wausau, WI</td>
<td>Won passage of a measure requiring the village to provide public transit service at least 5 days a week. Mill levy provides CATA with $3.2 million annually.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Wausau, W</td>
<td>Won additional $50,000 annual funding for Weston Transit service.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Previously Won Multi-Year Funding

#### Education

- **New York State Coalition**
  - Millionaires Tax extended - $1.9 billion annually from 2012
- **Niagara Falls and Buffalo, NY**
  - Day Care - expanded annually from 2010 thru 2012 to 3,900 children
- **Milwaukee, WI**
  - School Nurses - $950,000 annually from 2008

#### Infrastructure

- **Kansas City**
  - KC Sales Tax restoration - $7.2 million annually from 2011 for 3 years

#### Job Training

- **St. Paul, MN**
  - St. Paul Section 3 training - $300,000 annually from 2009
- **MN Statewide**
  - Minnesota training - $1 million annually from 2010
- **Oregon**
  - Pre-apprenticeship training - $1.5 million annually from 2009

#### Transit

- **Honolulu, HI**
  - Honolulu Authority for Regional Transit FTA - $30,000,000 annually
- **Prince George’s Co, MD**
  - Taxi Lottery from 2010 - 75 new taxi driver jobs annually
- **Saginaw, MI**
  - Saginaw transit operations - $1.8 million annually from 2010 for 5 years
## Appendix B | Gamaliel Affiliate Victories

### Previously Won Multi-Year Funding (cont.)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Transit</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Kalamazoo, MI</td>
<td>City of Kalamazoo - just under $1 million annually for 3 years through 2012</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kalamazoo, MI</td>
<td>Kalamazoo County - $3.3 million annually for 3 years through 2012</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kalamazoo, MI</td>
<td>Kalamazoo County - 2nd part of 2-part plan for $1 million annually for Metro Transit through 2012</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grand Rapids, MI</td>
<td>MI transit operation - $15.6 million annually from 2011 for 7 yrs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kansas City</td>
<td>Wyandotte KS County transit - $100,000 annually since 2008</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kenosha, WI</td>
<td>Transit Funding - $80,000 annually from 2011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Racine, WI</td>
<td>Transit Funding - $100,000 annually from 2011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wisconsin Statewide</td>
<td>Transit Funding - $72 million annually from 2011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saginaw, MI</td>
<td>Saginaw transit operations - $1.8 million annually from 2010 for 5 years</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ABOUT GAMALIEL

Gamaliel was started in 1986 to train community and faith leaders to build political power and create organizations that unite people of diverse faiths and races. Our mission is to empower ordinary people to effectively participate in the political, environmental, social and economic decisions affecting their lives. Gamaliel’s diverse members apply their faith and values to the pursuit of equal opportunity for all, shared abundance, and stronger, more prosperous communities.

We build strong local organizations

With 43 affiliates and 7 state offices in 16 states, Gamaliel works to build strong metropolitan and statewide organizations. National staff provides consulting, training and support to leaders and staff in local organizations. A survey of organizers and lead staff across the network at year’s end found that Gamaliel’s national staff is majority women. People of color are about 40 percent of organizers, lead organizers, and directors across the network (56% of organizers across network are women; 26% are women of color).

We develop powerful leaders through training

Gamaliel organizes three national weeklong trainings per year, an advanced leadership/strategic campaigns training, Ntosake training for women, African American Leadership Commission, National Clergy Caucus, and a national leadership gathering in Washington, D.C. These events reach more than 500 in total in a typical year. A study last year found that even up to three years following national weeklong training, past participants could identify significant ways in which the training has changed both their perception of how they build power and the skills that they use. 79% of participants noted that they still used a skill gained at training at least once a week.

We run influential advocacy & nonpartisan civic engagement campaigns

Gamaliel helped pioneer advocacy and organizing on regional equity 15 years ago working with partners like John Powell and the Ford Foundation. This work continues to be foundational to our policy and issue organizing. Recognizing infrastructure projects’ job-creation potential, and building on local affiliates worker rights’ advocacy, Gamaliel has focused its campaign and jobs work on increasing access to jobs and job training on these mega-projects. This is a major focus of current work along with other issue campaigns including education transparency and accountability and immigration reform.